

Program Completion Summary

Philippines

Programmatic AAA for Social Protection and Labor (P148753)

Created by Pablo Ariel Acosta on 20-Nov-2016

Last Modified by Pablo Ariel Acosta on 02-Dec-2016

Form Status:Archived

Program Basic Information			
Product Line	Title	Country, Region or Global	Program Team Leader(s)
Programmatic Approach	Programmatic AAA for Social Protection a	Philippines	Pablo Ariel Acosta,Aleksandra Posarac
Legal Name			Practice Manager/Manager
Programmatic AAA for Social Protection and Labor			Jehan Arulpragasam
Responsible CC (e.g. OPCDR)	Requesting CC (e.g. OPCDR)	Completion Fiscal Year	Status
GSP02 (0000009341)	EACPF (0000000336)	2017	Complete
Parent GPP			
Audience	Reimbursable Advisory Services		
Donor	No		
Includes RAS Subtask(s)?			
No			

Program Context, Development Objectives and Design

This section is descriptive not evaluative

Context at Program Concept Approval (Brief summary of country and sector background, rationale for undertaking program)

The Government of the Philippines has made significant progress in developing its social protection sector over the last 10 years, which has been one of its main strategies to address poverty and vulnerability. The most notable developments had been the introduction of a national household targeting system (more popularly known as Listahanan), a conditional cash transfer (CCT) program, and the universal health care (UHC) program that reaches out to the poorest Filipino families, i.e., those who belong to the bottom 40 percent as identified in the Listahanan.

The flagship social protection program is the Pantawid Pamilyang Pilipino Program, a CCT program. It was introduced to support poor families investment in health and education of children 0-14 and to alleviate their poverty. It has rapidly grown from 360,000 beneficiary households at the time it was launched in 2008 to 3.8 million poor households in 2013. By then, the Pantawid has become the world's third largest CCT program covering nearly 20 million people or 75% of the poor population and with a budget that reached 0.4% of GDP. Free health insurance and access to primary health care has been extended to all the Pantawid beneficiaries, as well as to other families that belonged to the bottom 40 percent of the population, as part of the UHC program. Both the Pantawid and UHC programs benefited from the Listahanan that was established in 2009. The Listahanan contains information of 11 million households nationwide (about 60 percent of the population), of which 5.2 million households were classified as poor and prioritized for various Government assistance programs.

Original Program Development Objectives (PDO) (as approved at Program Concept Approval)

This program seeks (i) to assist DSWD sustain the role of the CCT program as an well established and implemented backbone of the SSN in the Philippines. This will be achieved by further strengthening of the CCT operations and management , including identification of beneficiaries, eligibility and compliance verification, grievance and redress and payment delivery, MIS integration, monitoring and evaluation capacity and expansion to cover poor children in secondary education. The program also aims to (ii) to advance the implementation of the Government's convergence agenda by expanding and deepening the knowledge base and broadening the SP policy dialogue to include social security and labor market policies. In so doing, this program will contribute to the Government's efforts to reduce poverty and vulnerability and improve human capital of the poor.

The program will be realized through technical assistance, transfer of global knowledge and experience and knowledge exchange provided to the Department of Social Welfare and Development (DSWD). Most of these will be financed through the Australian Aid Trust Fund and will support DSWD in its continuous efforts to improve design and implementation of its flagship Pantawid Pamilya Program and other programs associated with it. In addition to technical assistance and

Public Disclosure Authorized

Public Disclosure Authorized

knowledge transfer, the program will also support several discrete pieces of analytical work, which are intended to inform the policy dialogue, not only around the social safety net programs, but also in other areas of social protection, such as labor market programs and social insurance. This part of the PAAA will be financed by the WBG budget.

Revised Program Development Objectives (PDO) (as approved at last Program Review) and reasons/justification for PDO revision

Other Significant Changes (In design, scope and scale, implementation arrangements and schedule, and funding)

Key Factors Affecting Implementation and Outcomes

Program Preparation & Design, including quality at entry (Including whether lessons of earlier operations were taken into account, risks and their mitigations identified, appropriate mix of sub-activities to achieve objectives, determination of key stakeholders and audience, and if they were appropriate to meeting the PDO)

The World Bank, jointly with Australian Aid (DFAT), first supported the Government's ambitious social protection agenda through a series of discrete technical assistance grants from 2006 through 2010. This was followed by the first Social Protection Programmatic AAA (SP PAAA) that covered FY2010-FY2015. The Bank's assistance throughout this foundational period for the Philippine SP system has been instrumental, particularly in the areas of poverty targeting, CCT implementation and monitoring, and rigorous analytical work to inform the broader policy dialogue on social safety nets and poverty reduction.

The second SPL PAAA FY2014-FY2017 (P148753) built on the results achieved in the first seven years of close collaboration with DSWD and DFAT. It sought to continue the technical support and advice to the Government in further strengthening its flagship SP programs while at the same time open new areas of engagement beyond social assistance and targeting, such as labor market policies and programs, and social insurance. While the foundational management information systems and procedures had already been established and functioning in support of Listahanan and the world's third largest CCT program, the Pantawid Pamilya, to deliver on their respective objectives, DSWD was keen to ensure that these systems continued to be strengthened and primed to meet evolving demands. The Government remained keen on learning more about how to make its CCT program more effective using rigorous evaluations and in-depth process assessments to inform necessary recalibration of the current program design and implementation. In addition, attention to other components of the social protection system was just as important. Thus, the second phase of technical assistance was designed to continuously provide high quality technical support to DSWD in its efforts to enhance the design of the CCT program and Listahanan and strengthen their operation systems and business processes. Also, the TA was designed to open the dialog in insurance/pensions and to further Bank engagement in the labor, skills, and jobs agenda.

To deliver on this ambitious program, a combination of just-in-time technical assistance on the daily operation and troubleshooting of DSWD programs, discrete analytical products, and capacity building workshops was designed over a 4-year period (FY14-FY17) to benefit mainly DSWD management and technical staff. All activities in the programs were discussed and agreed on with the counterparts in DSWD and in consultations with DFAT staff.

Implementation (including any program changes/restructuring, evolution of program to respond to changing conditions in country, and actions taken, as applicable. Also include actions taken during implementation such as adequacy of participatory processes, engaging key audiences, translations, etc.)

The program consisted of 5 pillars (components) with an original list of 14 discrete tasks with separate p-codes at CN approval in February 2014. After a year of implementation in February 2015, the program was restructured to (i) reflect changes in budget allocation with a more realistic set of achievable outputs, and (ii) manageability of the program by consolidating tasks. The restructuring also dropped one activity listed at CN (Assessment of Family Development Sessions under Pillar 1), which the client decided to do with their own funding. The restructured Program maintained the 5 original pillars and retained 7 subtasks (out of the original 14).

Total budget of the PAAA was \$2.66 million, quite in line with original allocation of \$2.64 million. The program was mostly (81%) financed by the Australian Aid Trust Fund (DFAT TF). This was supplemented by WB Bank Budget (BB), which funded WB staff time and discrete pieces of analytical work under Pillar 5 that were intended to inform the policy dialogue not only around the social safety net programs but also in other areas of social protection such as labor market programs and social insurance. Overall, BB contribution was higher than expected at CN. There was also general shifting between TF and BB resources within pillars.

Assessment of Risk to Development Outcomes

Assessment of Risk to Development Outcomes

Please address the chances of the intermediate outcomes progressing up the results chain to achievement of Outcomes. What factors and risks will play a key role in the clients acceptance and taking action on the programs recommendation(s) and/or capacity building efforts, and what is the likelihood that they

will be actualized into Outcomes?

The SP&L PAAA has successfully contributed in informing policy and operational decisions of the Government in the continuous enhancement of its core social protection instruments. The dialogue around social protection had been informed by high quality analytical products from this PAAA on topics related to targeting, social assistance design (specifically on the CCT and SLP), design of instruments for disaster/emergency response, social insurance and pensions, and labor.

This TA has been efficiently shaped reflecting client's priorities and needs. The outputs were identified and agreed with Government counterparts, so findings have high chance to impact directly in policy decisions.

Assessment of Outcomes

Relevance of Objectives, Design and Implementation (to current country and global priorities, and Bank assistance strategy)

This program was aligned well with the World Bank Group (WBG) twin goals of poverty reduction and shared prosperity. It directly contributed to the achievement of the objectives of the World Bank's Country Partnership Strategy for the Philippines, specifically in Engagement Area 2: Empowering the Poor and Vulnerable. Besides contributing to the achievement of better health and education outcomes for poor children, it also informed and assisted DSWD and other policy making agencies in efforts to improve program's performance by taking actions to continuously improve its implementation. More importantly, the PAAA was focused on strengthening the social protection as a whole - SP played an important role in the Philippine Government's overall strategy to reduce poverty and boost shared prosperity.

With its long and excellent tradition and track record in social protection, the WBG was uniquely positioned to conduct this PAAA. The program was a continuation of technical assistance which laid the foundations for the core safety net program, and continued to guide the dynamic evolution of the social protection system.

Achievement of Program Development Objectives

Overall Development Objective

	Rating	Explanation
Overall Development Objective	9-Very Effective	This TA has been efficiently shaped reflecting client's priorities and needs. It has also been closely aligned with the activities of the Bank's Social Welfare Development and Reform Project I and II (SWDRP I, P082144, 2010-2015; SWDRP II, P153744, 2016-2019). Although some changes and adjustments in timing and activities were necessary, the close working relationship with DSWD, DOLE, and SSS counterparts allowed the full use of the TA facility to still achieve its intended results. Furthermore, the TA deliverables have been subject to strict quality control arrangements, with most of deliverables going through technical reviews, prior to being finally delivered to the client.

Intermediate Outcome(s)

Please rate only those outcomes that were selected in the program Concept Note or during the last program review.

Intermediate Outcome	Rating	Explanation
Client capacity increased	9-Very Effective	The SPL PAAA carried out its objectives with an eye on building lasting capacity after the fact. Undertaken in this way, with World Bank technical staff working in the kitchen and being on

		demand to the needs and questions of the client whenever they arose, ownership of each component. Consequently, lasting capacity to administer these processes has been built, to the long term benefit of the implementing agency and the program.
--	--	-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Indicator(s)	Rating
Design capacity strengthened	9-Very Effective
Implementation capacity strengthened	9-Very Effective
Monitoring & Evaluation capacity increased	9-Very Effective

Intermediate Outcome	Rating	Explanation
Knowledge deepened	9-Very Effective	The dialog around social protection had been informed by high quality analytical products from this PAAA on topics related to targeting, social assistance design (specifically on the CCT and SLP), design of instruments for disaster/emergency response, social insurance and pensions, and labor.

Indicator(s)	Rating
Facilitated exchange of best practice w/ clients	10-Exceptionally Effective

Intermediate Outcome	Rating	Explanation
Policy/strategy informed	9-Very Effective	The SP PAAA allowed the World Bank to work in full partnership with DSWD throughout its SP reform process.

Indicator(s)	Rating
Bank country strategy informed	10-Exceptionally Effective
Government policy/strategy informed	9-Very Effective
Public debate stimulated/initiated	9-Very Effective

Custom Outcome(s)

Please rate only those outcomes that were selected in the program Concept Note or during the last program review.

Custom Outcome(s)	Rating	Explanation
MIS system strengthened through the integration of operational business processes modules	8-Effective	The business process review of the CCT's MIS led to a larger, more in-depth review of the business process of Pantawid Pamilya. This study found that the CCT as a program is able to accomplish its objectives by effectively reaching out to more than 4.4 million beneficiaries. This means that the right beneficiaries are able to receive the appropriate grants according to their degree of compliance with program conditionalities, and that process controls are in place to ensure this. The

		<p>report found that it still has significant room for improvement in terms of enhancing controls and in ensuring data integrity and accuracy. The report observed that the key vulnerabilities of the program relate to the multiple manual conduct of tasks across the Pantawid processes coupled with its unintegrated information systems. Furthermore, the inflexibility of the current information systems paired with the regular changes being made in the processes and policies make it difficult for the systems and processes to fully synchronize and nimbly adapt to any changes in direction. It therefore recommended to further automate processes and integrate information systems. This entails improving the Pantawid's technological infrastructure, with primary focus on upgrading its database. This upgrade would reduce bottlenecks experienced in data processing, promote efficient processing, and strengthen internal controls. Implementing IT service management practices will also help in ensuring that the Pantawid's information systems will become more responsive to the changing needs of the program. These findings were discussed in depth with new authorities at DSWD, which are now taking action for its implementation.</p>
Indicator(s)	Rating	
MIS system automated linkages between operations modules functional.	7-Moderately Effective	
Custom Outcome(s)	Rating	Explanation
CCT expanded to poor students in secondary education	10-Exceptionally Effective	<p>This sub-task aimed to provide hands-on, just-in-time technical support to DSWD during the preparation, launch and roll out of the CCT expansion to cover children in secondary education. A technical note was intended to support the eventual roll-out of the CCT program to poor children in secondary education who are 15-18 years of age. The study on the CCT expansion to secondary education led to eventual adoption of Government to cover older children into the program. The study and the Bank's technical and operational advice concerning the nuts and bolts of expansion (identification and verification</p>

		<p>of eligible children, payment, roll out, etc.) helped DSWD in its efforts to mobilize public support for the change in design of the CCT program. The decision on extending grants to secondary school came after the Bank made a presentation to economic cabinet. The expansion was completed satisfactorily and the payment of the CCT grants to 1.2 million poor children in secondary education (up to 18 years of age), commenced in June 2014 and retroactively covering grants for kids who complied with the 85% attendance conditionality beginning in January 2014.</p>
Indicator(s)	Rating	
Eligible secondary education children enrolled and receive grants	10-Exceptionally Effective	
Custom Outcome(s)	Rating	Explanation
Second round IE completed and DSWD IE capacity strengthened	9-Very Effective	<p>Building upon the successful conduct of the first round of the Impact Evaluation (IE) in 2012 supported under the first phase SP PAAA, this pillar continued the technical support to DSWD in the design, supervision, and analysis of the second IE of the Conditional Cash Transfer Program and to document its impact on key outcomes related to health and education. This emanated from the strong demand from DSWD for continued rigorous impact evaluation of the biggest program of the Department to justify its continuation, but also the demand for continued knowledge transfer on how to conduct and analyze rigorous IEs. At the request of DSWD, an IE expert was hired to provide continuous hands-on technical advice, guidance and training, throughout the complete cycle of the second round CCT IE. Documentation of good practice and capacity building are already helping DSWD in the conduct of the third round of the IE data collection and in other data collection efforts. Results from the impact evaluations are always cited in various policy circles during discussions on program continuity and budget, in Congress and at Cabinet meetings.</p>
Indicator(s)	Rating	
Second round IE data set published and IE report completed by DSWD	9-Very Effective	

Custom Outcome(s)	Rating	Explanation
CCT operations strengthened	9-Very Effective	<p>The pillar also supported DSWD on the conduct of several assessments and consequently enhancements in selected processes of Pantawid Pamilya particularly the payment and grievance redress system (GRS). The entire business process and management information system of GRS was assessed to identify, quantify and analyze the strengths and weaknesses of the system since its inception in 2008. Results of the assessment served as guide in streamlining the Pantawid Pamilya operations and processes and instituting policies and accountabilities to address grievances on program implementation. Likewise, the pillar assisted DSWD in several capacity building activities conducted to enhance the knowledge and skills of field staff in managing requests and complaints about the program. Several workshops were done to gather inputs from field staff, the main implementer or frontline workers who provide crucial information to the beneficiaries and public at large about the program. All activities were executed timely and in close collaboration with DSWD. Most of the recommendations in the GRS Assessment were already in place which include redefined grievance typologies, enhanced GRS flowchart (with clear accountability, feasible timeline and resolution indicators), simplified and localized grievance uptake form and decentralized strategy of grievance handing to provide immediate advice to beneficiaries on queries regarding updates, compliance and payment concerns. The PAAA provided financial and technical capacity to disseminate the results of the assessment and to ensure continuous, efficient and effective implementation of GRS operations. The PAAA implementation greatly provided support in the operational and strategic operations of the program.</p> <p>Findings from the assessment of the CCT payment system resulted in operational changes in the payment procedures of the CCT program not only to improve speed of delivering cash</p>

		<p>grants to beneficiaries but also to facilitate faster liquidation. This task with the delivery of a Technical Note on the findings and detailed operational recommendations to strengthen the CCT Payment System, Under the guidance of DSWD’s appointed focal, in the person of the Undersecretary for Finance, several consultations were with partner agencies Land Bank of the Philippines (LBP) and the Commissions on Audit (COA), as well as a series of consultations and presentations with relevant units in DSWD at the central and field offices.</p>
Indicator(s)	Rating	
Improved payment and grievance and redress systems	7-Moderately Effective	
Custom Outcome(s)	Rating	Explanation
NHTSPR updated	10-Exceptionally Effective	<p>The WB TA has been instrumental to the success of updating the Listahanan database, the benefits of which are far reaching beyond Philippines. The update of Listahanan will help continue increasing both the efficiency and effectiveness of public spending to target programs to the poor and vulnerable in the Philippines. The significance of this achievement extends far beyond the country. Grounded in empirical studies, the experience of Listahanan is as a leading good practice example for a growing number of countries that aspire to introduce such registries. The resources and technical assistance from the WB, coupled with ample time for preparation, allowed DSWD to adopt several innovations for 2015 Listahanan. In 2012, soon after the first round of Listahanan was released, DSWD immediately kick-started the preparatory phase for the second round of targeting in 2015. Experience from the first round of a massive and nationwide household targeting highlighted several operational aspects that required special attention for the succeeding rounds of targeting. These include improving the design and performance of the PMT models, reducing the period for data collection, using the latest available technology (as tablets and mobile applications), improving the management information</p>

		system (MIS), strengthening training of enumerators and other field staff, and adopting effective strategic communication practices, which all contribute to increasing the accuracy of Listahanan in identifying the poor.
--	--	-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Indicator(s)	Rating
Second round household welfare assessment completed	10-Exceptionally Effective

Custom Outcome(s)	Rating	Explanation
Knowledge and understanding of SP issues and policies deepened	8-Effective	The Labor Market and Social Security Reviews contributed to the body of knowledge on labor and insurance/pensions policies in the Philippines. While studies on employment and labor policies in the Philippines abound, including the World Bank, <i>Philippine Development Report Creating More and Better Jobs</i> , released in September 2013, most of these reports focused on the role of macroeconomic policies and labor regulations on jobs and employment. The labor report contributed to the dearth of studies that links employment and labor policies to poverty and social protection policies. In addition, there is also insufficient information and assessment about the country's insurance and pensions systems and its sustainability. The note on social insurance and pensions, in particular, contributed to understanding (i) how to increase the de facto coverage of social security (de jure, all employed persons in the Philippines are mandated to contribute to SSS), and (ii) how to ensure long term sustainability of the SSS.

Indicator(s)	Rating
Public discourse and policy dialogue broadens to include social security and labor market	8-Effective

Justification of Overall Outcome Rating (combining relevance, achievement of PDOs and efficiency)

Overall Outcome Rating is Satisfactory, given high relevance, very effective achievement of PDO and efficiency.

Other Unintended Outcomes and Impacts (positive or negative)

Beyond DSWD, this task also contributed to broadening technical expertise of the pool of local researchers in undertaking impact evaluations. While some expertise on impact evaluations exist in-country, the use of RDD methodology has not been widely used by local academics and researchers until this second round of IE for the CCT program. An international expert on impact evaluations from the Bank's Development Economics Group (DECPI) and another international expert from academia provided guidance and technical support to the local research group hired by DSWD to prepare the second IE report. The technical guidance from the IE experts served three main purposes: (i) to assure sound technical procedures in the conduct of the second IE analysis based on international best practice experiences; (ii) to capacitate further the DSWD technical staff and the local research team, which was particularly important given that same methodologies will be used for

the third round IE; and (iii) to brainstorm about possible design and research questions for the third round IE. Workshops were held with the local research group, which consisted of a 1 Senior Economist and 4 Economists and Data Analysts, to discuss methodological details of undertaking RDD analysis and peer review results. It is hoped that the third round of IE for the CCT will further intensify participation and involvement of local researchers and academics in all aspects of the study.

Summary of Findings of Client Feedback and/or Stakeholder Workshops (Please describe in summary form feedback from clients, partners, key audiences, etc. This section should provide evidence of impact, e.g., if the objective was to inform government policy, a ministerial level discussion or workshop would provide evidence that the policy was being informed by the Banks work since it was being debated and discussed.)

The SPL core course has been a one-of-a-kind event, first time done in a single country. Beyond DSWD, several agencies participated, such as Department of Finance, NEDA, Department of Labor, Social Security System, and TESDA. Using the conceptual framework presented in the course, participants teamed up to apply their learning and identify key issues in the areas of SP system, social safety nets, social security and labor markets in the Philippines and proposed strategic actions for short and long term implementation. The participants pointed out that these inputs will be used and further elaborated as the Philippines moves forward to update the Social Protection Operational Framework and prepare the SP strategy, as well as the new Philippine Development Plan.

Bank Performance

Areas to be rated	Rating
Overall Bank Performance	9-Very Effective
Strategic Relevance & Ownership	10-Exceptionally Effective
Technical Quality	9-Very Effective
Client Engagement/Dissemination	10-Exceptionally Effective
Timeliness	10-Exceptionally Effective

Comments

Budget and Funding (amount in USD)

Resources	Bank Budget	Bank-executed Trust Fund	Other	Total
Total estimated at Concept (including subtasks)	430,000.00	2,000,000.00	0.00	2,430,000.00
Total Actual (including subtasks)	341,005.62	1,638,947.79	0.00	1,979,953.41

Duration of Program

Concept approval to today's date (in days) 1013

Milestone	Original	Actual
AIS Sign-Off	11-Nov-2013	07-Nov-2013
Program Concept Review	18-Feb-2014	20-Feb-2014
Management Approval of Program Concept	20-Feb-2014	06-Mar-2014
Final Delivery/Prog. Completion Summary	09-Jun-2016	13-Dec-2016

Activities Assessment

Strategic Pillars

Strategic Pillar	Description (optional)
------------------	------------------------

Strategic Pillar	Description (optional)
<p>Technical Assistance on the Design and Implementation of the CCT</p>	<p>This pillar will continue to provide knowledge and technical assistance to help DSWD adjust the design and continuously improve implementation arrangements for the CCT program. The CCT program is currently being expanded to reach all eligible poor children 0-18 years of age. The CCT program implementation is underpinned by a complex administrative architecture from identification of beneficiary households, to compliance verification to grievance and redress to delivery of payments to beneficiary households. It is a huge mechanism, operating at various levels of government. It is constantly under the public and media magnifying glass and under extreme pressure to perform flawlessly. The program is thus one of the flagship participants in the Open Government initiative, with innovative open data platform and web based front and back office functions to enable easy and transparent access to information on the CCT program to all citizens.</p>
<p>Technical Assistance on Targeting</p>	<p>After the successful implementation of the country's first National Household Targeting System for Poverty Reduction (NHTSPR) - Listahanan in 2009-2011, the National Household Targeting Office (NHTO) of DSWD is getting ready to update the system in the 2014-2015 household re-assessment. The current NHTSPR has become the official poverty targeting database for all nationally supported programs, including the Philippine's core social assistance programs, the Pantawid Pamilya and Universal Health Care. Other government agencies – both at national and local levels – are already anticipating the results of the updated NHTSPR for the expansion of other services, such as water and sanitation in rural areas. Based on lessons learned from the first NHTSPR implementation, the government has committed to make the necessary improvements in this next round of implementation, including enhancing the tool it used to identify poor households and improving survey operations with a view to covering more households (especially in rural areas) in a cost effective manner. There is also need to intensify efforts to build shared understanding and stronger support around the NHTSPR, more generally among various stakeholders but also within government. There is a healthy interest and debate on how best to update the targeting database. It will be important to ground the debate on international best practice and the specifics of the Philippines context to come up with a high quality, sustainable, database which has credibility and integrity with regard to accuracy.</p> <p>This pillar will thus provide support to DSWD in their continuous improvement of the NHTSPR, specifically in refining the tools and field operations for the 2014-2015 re-assessment, and in generating better understanding and stronger support for it. This entails just-in-time policy advice, close oversight of operations and trouble-shooting and facilitating active dialog with various stakeholders and potential users of the targeting database. Support to these activities is critically important in maintaining the integrity of the program and ensuring its sustainability.</p>

Leveraging the CCT program to Increase Opportunities, Inclusiveness, and Protection

As the CCT program matures, the Government is seeking to diversify and customize its social protection programs to better respond to different risks faced by Filipino households and the nature of poverty (e.g. chronic vs. transient poverty). To be able to do that a better understanding vulnerability and resiliency is needed. The Government is also keen to take advantage of the CCT program's infrastructure and outreach to strengthen the Government's Social Protection agenda. The intent is to extend the options to increase opportunities for beneficiaries to link to other social programs, as well as modifying the CCT program design to reach those in special circumstances or those with special needs. The Technical Assistance program will also focus on further linking the CCT program more comprehensively as a platform for reducing poverty and vulnerability through expanding the scope of the CCT program as well as strengthening synergies with other programs. This is very much in line with the "convergence" agenda as articulated in the "Social Protection Operational Framework and Strategy of the Philippines". The Government also wants to consider how beneficiaries may "graduate" from the CCT program into other appropriate programs. As noted in the Operational Framework, it will be important to link the "protection" agenda of the CCT with "promotion" of opportunities for beneficiaries. As such, this pillar will support Government in the broader agenda of the SP Operational Framework and the "second generation" issues following the successful implementation of the CCT program. This is a conversation that is lively in parts of the world with mature social assistance programs, and it will be very useful to expose policy-makers to some of the international discussion and debate on these issues. At this stage, this component would be focused on assessing options that can be operationalized in a subsequent phase, presenting design considerations.

<p>The CCT Impact Evaluation</p>	<p>Building upon the successful conduct of the first round of the Impact Evaluation (IE) supported under the first phase SP PAAA, this pillar will continue to support DSWD in the design, supervision, and analysis of the impact evaluation of the Conditional Cash Transfer Program and to document its impact on key outcomes related to health and education. First, this activity will assist DSWD with the cleaning of the raw data of the first round of IE, which will be publically available for research and analysis. Second, a top-notch technical assistance will be provided to teach and guide relevant DSWD staff and local researches to analyze this data set. Third, this activity will provide technical support to DSWD and undertake capacity building for the second round IE design, implementation and data analysis.</p> <p>There is strong demand from DSWD for more rigorous Impact Evaluations and more TA on transfer of knowledge on how to conduct and analyze rigorous IEs. DSWD attributes the fact that the budget hearing processes in 2012 was smoother and significantly less critical of Pantawid Pamilya due to the successful dissemination of the Initial Findings from the CCT Impact Evaluation. The DSWD is not only interested in good news from the study to rally support, but they are also willing to learn about challenges that the impact evaluation identifies, to improve the program design and efficiency and effectiveness of program implementation. In addition to providing technical assistance and guidance, this activity will transfer knowledge and build capacity in DSWD and in a team of local researchers.</p>
<p>Improving the Knowledge Base and Informing Policy Dialogue</p>	<p>The WBG engagement in social protection in the Philippines has understandably been focused on assisting the government with extremely complex and enormously vast task of designing and implementing the conditional cash transfer program. To expand the policy dialogue and assist the government beyond the CCT program with the objective of weaving different programs into a coherent, harmonized, efficient and effective system, the World Bank needs to expand its knowledge base in areas of Social Insurance and Labor Market Policies and Programs.</p>

Summary of Activities

Pillar: Technical Assistance on the Design and Implementation of the CCT

Project ID	Project Name and Product Line	RAS	Project Status	Team Leader	Date Completed	Total Expenses to Date	Comments
P150516	CCT expansion to secondary education (TA)	No	Complete	Yuko Okamura	18-Jun-2015	0.00	
P150519	CCT business processess, GRS and MIS(TA)	No	Complete	Pablo Ariel Acosta	18-Nov-2016	732,749.05	

Pillar: Technical Assistance on Targeting

Project ID	Project Name and Product Line	RAS	Project Status	Team Leader	Date Completed	Total Expenses to Date	Comments
P150527	Updating and improving the NHTSPR(TA)	No	Complete	Pablo Ariel Acosta	03-Jun-2016	253,291.55	

Pillar: Leveraging the CCT program to Increase Opportunities, Inclusiveness, and Protection

Project ID	Project Name and Product Line	RAS	Project Status	Team Leader	Date Completed	Total Expenses to Date	Comments
P150530	SP and disaster preparedness(TA)	No	Complete	Aleksandra Posarac	16-Oct-2015	0.00	

Pillar: The CCT Impact Evaluation

Project ID	Project Name and Product Line	RAS	Project Status	Team Leader	Date Completed	Total Expenses to Date	Comments
P150532	CCT Impact Evaluation (TA)	No	Complete	Aleksandra Posarac	21-Nov-2016	653,025.21	

Pillar: Improving the Knowledge Base and Informing Policy Dialogue

Project ID	Project Name and Product Line	RAS	Project Status	Team Leader	Date Completed	Total Expenses to Date	Comments
P150534	Social insurance issues note(TA)	No	Complete	Aleksandra Posarac	24-Jun-2016	0.00	
P150535	Labor market review (TA)	No	Complete	Jan J. Rutkowski	27-Apr-2016	24,133.93	

Pillar: Technical Assistance on the Design and Implementation of the CCT

CCT expansion to secondary education

Title	Reimbursable Advisory Services	Product Line	Country
CCT expansion to secondary education		Technical Assistance (Non-lending)	Philippines
Team Leader		Separate CN?	Prior Management Endorsement
Yuko Okamura		No	No
Responsible Cost Center	Project ID	AIS Sign Off	Final Delivery/CS
GSP02 (9341)	P150516	30-Apr-2014	18-Jun-2015

Describe the contribution of this activity to the overall development objective

The CCT program was expanded in 2014 from covering children 0-14 years of age to children up to 18, and adjustments in the CCT delivery mechanisms were needed to accommodate the change. This sub-task aimed to provide hands-on, just-in-time technical support to DSWD during the preparation, launch and roll out of the CCT expansion to cover children in secondary education. A technical note was intended to support the eventual roll-out of the CCT program to poor children in secondary education who are 15-18 years of age.

CCT business processes, GRS and MIS

Title	Reimbursable Advisory Services	Product Line	Country
CCT business processes, GRS and MIS		Technical Assistance (Non-lending)	Philippines
Team Leader		Separate CN?	Prior Management Endorsement
Pablo Ariel Acosta		No	No
Responsible Cost Center	Project ID	AIS Sign Off	Final Delivery/CS
GSP02 (9341)	P150519	30-Apr-2014	18-Nov-2016

Describe the contribution of this activity to the overall development objective

This subtask assessed existing system requirements and the necessary enhancements to significantly improve the efficiency of the CCT program implementation. Specifically, it assessed the following: (i) business process related to the

CCT payment, and Grievance Redress System (GRS); and (ii) the automated integration of the various components of the CCT MIS architecture. This subtask also supported training of CCT field implementers (Municipal Links and Grievance Officers) to help them perform more effectively and help resolve issues expeditiously. Assistance in developing and rolling out a campaign was also extended to increase awareness of the general public on the GRS process.

Pillar: Technical Assistance on Targeting

Updating and improving the NHTSPR

Title	Reimbursable Advisory Services	Product Line	Country
Updating and improving the NHTSPR		Technical Assistance (Non-lending)	Philippines
Team Leader		Separate CN?	Prior Management Endorsement
Pablo Ariel Acosta		No	No
Responsible Cost Center	Project ID	AIS Sign Off	Final Delivery/CS
GSP02 (9341)	P150527	30-Apr-2014	03-Jun-2016

Describe the contribution of this activity to the overall development objective

This sub-task provided technical assistance in two areas.

- a) Updating and Improving Listahanan. This component continued the advice and technical assistance in enhancing the Proxy Means Test (PMT) models that are used by Listahanan to identify poor households, and designing new instruments that support the enhanced PMT models accordingly. This component also supported several activities that are critical for the effective implementation of the Listahanan ground operations for its update. This included assistance in developing and pretesting questionnaires, updating the field manuals and training materials. On the systems side, to ensure accurate data collection, efficient data processing, and secure management of huge personal information, the Bank supported a systems review of the entire MIS structure of Listahanan and the development of a tablet application for faster and more efficient data collection and processing. Lastly, this component sought to assess the targeting accuracy of the new and enhanced PMT models. This component funded the engagement of local and international consultants, travels to supervise field activities, and meetings/workshops.
- b) Expanding Utilization of the Listahanan Database. Continued technical assistance was also provided to DSWD in developing communication material and support stakeholder dialogues to build broader and stronger support for the updated Listahanan.

Pillar: Leveraging the CCT program to Increase Opportunities, Inclusiveness, and Protection

SP and disaster preparedness

Title	Reimbursable Advisory Services	Product Line	Country
SP and disaster preparedness		Technical Assistance (Non-lending)	Philippines
Team Leader		Separate CN?	Prior Management Endorsement
Aleksandra Posarac		No	No
Responsible Cost Center	Project ID	AIS Sign Off	Final Delivery/CS
GSP02 (9341)	P150530	30-Apr-2014	16-Oct-2015

Describe the contribution of this activity to the overall development objective

Being one of the countries that are most vulnerable to natural disasters, the Philippines has unfortunately accumulated significant knowledge and experience on how to respond to disasters. It has also taken significant steps to ready various sectors, including DSWD and social protection for disaster response. DSWD, which is the primary agency in charge of social protection, is also the agency tasked with first response at times of disaster. DSWD is continuously looking at options to keep improving its disaster response readiness and to make its programs resilient to disaster.

This pillar examined lessons from the recent disaster response and look at the options for improvements based on lessons learned, as well experience from other countries. Outputs included workshops with global experts, and other forms of knowledge transfer and exchange. It was envisioned that these outputs will inform improvements in the social protection disaster response readiness.

Pillar: The CCT Impact Evaluation

CCT Impact Evaluation

Title	Reimbursable Advisory Services	Product Line	Country
CCT Impact Evaluation		Technical Assistance (Non-lending)	Philippines
Team Leader		Separate CN?	Prior Management Endorsement
Aleksandra Posarac		No	No
Responsible Cost Center	Project ID	AIS Sign Off	Final Delivery/CS
GSP02 (9341)	P150532	02-Apr-2014	21-Nov-2016

Describe the contribution of this activity to the overall development objective

Building upon the successful conduct of the first round of the Impact Evaluation (IE) in 2012 supported under the first phase SP PAAA, this pillar continued the technical support to DSWD in the design, supervision, and analysis of the second IE of the Conditional Cash Transfer Program and to document its impact on key outcomes related to health and education. This emanated from the strong demand from DSWD for continued rigorous impact evaluation of the biggest program of the Department to justify its continuation, but also the demand for continued knowledge transfer on how to conduct and analyze rigorous IEs.

The objectives of this task were to: (i) undertake capacity building in DSWD and in a team of local researchers for the second round IE design, implementation and data analysis; and (ii) provide high-level technical assistance to teach and guide relevant DSWD staff and local researchers to analyze this data set, with the assistance of global experts and local researchers.

Pillar: Improving the Knowledge Base and Informing Policy Dialogue

Social insurance issues note

Title	Reimbursable Advisory Services	Product Line	Country
Social insurance issues note		Technical Assistance (Non-lending)	Philippines
Team Leader		Separate CN?	Prior Management Endorsement
Aleksandra Posarac		No	Yes
Responsible Cost Center	Project ID	AIS Sign Off	Final Delivery/CS
GSP02 (9341)	P150534	30-Apr-2014	24-Jun-2016

Describe the contribution of this activity to the overall development objective

The note intended to map social insurance programs in the Philippines, including social insurance arrangements for old age, disability, work injury, survivorship and unemployment. It looked at programs design and performance parameters, including eligibility criteria, adequacy of benefits, coverage, dependency ratios, replacement ratios, contribution rates and financing and public spending. It compared the Philippines to other countries and identified issues that need attention. It is expected that the note produced will contribute to the existing knowledge base on social insurance in the Philippines and globally and inform policy dialogue in-country.

Labor market review

Title	Reimbursable Advisory Services	Product Line	Country
Labor market review		Technical Assistance (Non-lending)	Philippines
Team Leader		Separate CN?	Prior Management Endorsement
Jan J. Rutkowski		No	Yes
Responsible Cost Center	Project ID	AIS Sign Off	Final Delivery/CS
GSP02 (9341)	P150535	30-Apr-2014	27-Apr-2016

Describe the contribution of this activity to the overall development objective

The review aims to better understand the role of social protection programs in facilitating labor market participation of poor and vulnerable population. It builds on existing WBG reports such as the Jobs Report and the Skills Report and will provide additional information on labor market situation and developments based on the latest (2012) FIES and Labor Force Survey. The review was intended to map labor legislation, workers protection provisions and arrangements and how they apply given significant labor force and employment informality in the Philippines. It also mapped existing labor market programs and assess their design, scope and scale viz-a-vis the needs and other countries. The main output was a labor market study that contributed to the knowledge base on labor market issues and improve and policy dialogue on related issues.

Role of Clients/Partners

Client Ownership

Did the client ask for this initiative?

Yes

Did the client agree to the concept/scope/design?

Yes

Did the client participate in carrying out the program?

Yes

Did the client help finance the program?

No

Comments

Contact Information

Please provide a name for the activity that is recognizable by the client. This is the name that will appear in the survey.

Partners/Other Programs

Were other partners doing similar programs? If yes, did you ensure this person was not duplicative and/or had value-added? Explain

Asian Development Bank and Australian DFAT are also supporting DSWD. To ensure that activities in this PAAA do not overlap, a coordination meeting chaired by DSWD to review all activities and ensure that there is no duplication was organized.

Were there one or more partners who either funding this activity or contributed expertise?

Yes

Australian DFAT through TF is financing Advisory Activities in this PAAA (Pillars 1-4).

Partners

Organization Name	Type	Contact	Title	Office Phone	Email

Is this a joint work with IFC? No

Practice Area Mapping

Practice Area (Lead)

Social Protection & Labor

Contributing Practice Areas

Finance & Markets, Governance

Gender Tag

Does the activity support (select all that apply)

Analysis and/or consultation on gender related issues

Yes

Specific actions to address the distinct needs of women and girls, or men and boys, or positive impacts on gender gaps

Yes

Mechanisms to monitor gender impact to facilitate gender-disaggregated analysis

Yes

Major Findings, Lessons Learned/Next Steps

Major Findings and Lessons Learned

As with the first SPL PAAA (P118853), maximum results of the WB's technical assistance are achieved when there is: (i) strong ownership and leadership from the Government; (ii) the TA is designed to fit the purpose with concrete activities; and (iii) TA complements a World Bank lending operation. This TA has been efficiently shaped reflecting the client's priorities and needs. It has also been closely aligned with the activities of the Bank's Social Welfare Development and Reform Project I and II (SWDRP I, P082144, 2010-2015; SWDRP II, P153744, 2016-2019). Although some changes and adjustments in timing and activities were necessary, the close working relationship with DSWD, DOLE, and SSS counterparts allowed the full use of the TA facility to still achieve its intended results. Furthermore, the TA deliverables have been subject to strict quality control arrangements, with most of deliverables going through technical reviews, prior to being finally delivered to the client.

The DFAT TF funding has been instrumental to the success of this PAAA. This PAAA would not be able to accomplish what it has accomplished without DFAT TF funding. The bank budget alone would have never allowed the team to engage across so many critical tasks and areas, nor to engage a stream of best experts in impact evaluation, targeting and CCT implementation. This strongly demonstrates the continued importance of grant funded TA in enabling the World Bank to help governments implement new and complex programs. The close collaboration with DFAT staff on the ground throughout the whole implementation period has only strengthened the TA activities implemented under this TA.

An aspect that could have been improved is adequate budget and task planning at the point of Program entry. One of the challenges that was faced during was the creation of 14 child codes that proved hard to administer. Overtime, these was consolidated into more manageable 7 child tasks. Predictability of funding allocation is also critical in multi-year planning of activities and delivering results: this PAAA experienced drastic changes in funding allocation from original approved to reduced allocation in the middle of implementation of activities. More adequate planning at entry is critical to avoid diverting focus from substantive TA implementation into cumbersome administrative management.

Such a sustained technical assistance engagement can be the key to strengthening capacity within an implementing agency. The preceding analysis has repeatedly made reference to the many ways in which the SPL PAAA carried out its objectives, with an eye on building lasting capacity after the fact. Undertaken in this way, with World Bank technical staff working in the kitchen and being responsive to the demands of the client whenever they arose, the TA promoted an even stronger client ownership of the activities. Consequently, lasting capacity to administer these processes has been built, to the long term benefit of the implementing agency and the program.

Assess and describe the benefits of utilizing a programmatic approach in meeting the development objective

Programmatic tasks are a powerful tool that can allow the World Bank to be fully engaged throughout the implementation of an ambitious, long-term SP systems building agenda. The SP PAAA allowed the World Bank to work in full partnership with DSWD throughout its SP reform process. The SP PAAA meant that every tool in the technical assistance tool kit could be leveraged under the umbrella of the PAAA, from just-in-time policy advice, to in the field supervision of implementation, to rigorous analytical pieces and more. Taken together, this comprehensive leveraging of World Bank resources in response to myriad client technical assistance demands helped to support the national household targeting system, the Pantawid CCT, and the broader SP system, through a partnership between the World Bank and Government counterparts in a way that piecemeal TA could not.

Next Steps (Describe expected follow-up)

As next steps, and with a Government administration in place, the CCT and Listahanan need to evolve to adjust to the new priorities, and the Bank should remain engaged to facilitate that transition. In that sense, the SPL team expects a follow up TA focused on second generation issues on the CCT and Targeting agenda (financial inclusion, responsiveness to disaster shocks, dynamic updating, linkages to sustainable livelihood options) as other countries have undertaken. Ideally, team would explore opportunities for additional TF resources from DFAT or other development partners to leverage Bank resources. On the labor front, a new TA task focused on skills can help operationalize many of the findings and recommendations from the labor report. The team will continue exploring options for further engagement on social security

aspects.