Higher Education Research for Innovation and Competitiveness Project (P122785)

EUROPE AND CENTRAL ASIA | Montenegro | Education Global Practice | IBRD/IDA | Specific Investment Loan | FY 2012 | Seq No: 8 | ARCHIVED on 02-Feb-2016 | ISR22493 |

Implementing Agencies: Ministry of Science

Key Dates

**Key Project Dates**

- Bank Approval Date: 24-Jan-2012
- Effectiveness Date: 21-May-2012
- Planned Mid Term Review Date: 08-Jun-2015
- Actual Mid-Term Review Date: 24-May-2015
- Original Closing Date: 30-Mar-2017
- Revised Closing Date: 30-Mar-2017

Project Development Objectives

Project Development Objective (from Project Appraisal Document)

The Project development objective is to strengthen the quality and relevance of higher education and research in Montenegro through reforming the higher education finance and quality assurance systems and by strengthening research and development capabilities.

Has the Project Development Objective been changed since Board Approval of the Project Objective?

No

Components

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Cost</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Higher Education Finance Reforms and Implementation of Quality Assurance Norms</td>
<td>$3.73 M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human Capital Development through Internationalization Initiatives</td>
<td>$2.81 M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Establishing a Competitive Research Environment</td>
<td>$7.94 M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Project Management and Monitoring and Evaluation</td>
<td>$1.26 M</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Overall Ratings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Previous Rating</th>
<th>Current Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Progress towards achievement of PDO</td>
<td>Satisfactory</td>
<td>Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Implementation Progress (IP)</td>
<td>Satisfactory</td>
<td>Moderately Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Risk Rating</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Implementation Status and Key Decisions

Component 1: Higher Education Finance Reforms and Implementation of Quality Assurance Norms
1. Higher Education Financing. Notable progress has been made toward implementing a new model since the last implementation support visit.
2. Quality Assurance. The entire higher education sector, including universities and research institutions, has undergone a comprehensive external evaluation.
3. Graduate Tracer Study. Tracer study design continues as expected.

Component 2: Internationalization
4. Student Hostel Renovations. All student hostel renovations planned utilizing project funds have been completed.
5. Master's student scholarships. The first round of scholarships was completed and awards were agreed with 35 students to study abroad this academic year.

Component 3: Research
6. Centre of Excellence. Activities at the pilot Centre of Excellence are progressing well after some early implementation delays.
7. National Research Grants. Seven research grant projects are well into implementation, while an eight was signed in October 2015.
8. PhD and post-doctoral student scholarships. Awards allowed 26 students to study abroad this year.

Component 4: Project Management
9. Project Management Unit. Strong management of the project on the part of all counterparts in the HERIC program management office continues.
## Risks

**Systematic Operations Risk-rating Tool**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Risk Category</th>
<th>Rating at Approval</th>
<th>Previous Rating</th>
<th>Current Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Political and Governance</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macroeconomic</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sector Strategies and Policies</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical Design of Project or Program</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institutional Capacity for Implementation and Sustainability</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fiduciary</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environment and Social</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stakeholders</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Results

**Project Development Objective Indicators**
Complete external evaluation of 3 main universities, utilizing new quality assurance and accreditation measures developed in accordance with Bologna-defined EU norms and practices. (Text, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Increase in the perception of relevance of higher education programs and degrees (Percentage, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>86.00</td>
<td>86.00</td>
<td>86.00</td>
<td>103.20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Comments
We are re-evaluating this index baseline for accuracy and may revise.

Establish one pilot Center of Excellence (Number, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Comments
The center of excellence is established.

Establish 10 public/private or international R&D partnerships and/or business start-ups with research institutes or university faculties. (Number, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>8.00</td>
<td>10.00</td>
<td>10.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Overall Comments

Intermediate Results Indicators

➤ Implementation of new higher education funding model. (Text, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Funding model not developed</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>The Ministry of Education has adopted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>a new model regarding the optimal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>funding model for the State University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>and is negotiating terms. Model</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>expected to be implemented by</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>September 2016.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>New funding model implemented</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comments</td>
<td>This is on track to be achieved for academic year 2016-2017.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

➤ National Qualifications Framework developed and adopted. (Text, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value</th>
<th>Baseline competency not developed for any program</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Baseline competencies not developed for any program</td>
<td>Objective being met via alternate source of EU funds. Competencies being developed via those funds at each institution.</td>
<td>Objective being met via alternate source of EU funds. Competencies being developed via those funds at each institution.</td>
<td>Baseline competencies developed and adopted for 180 programs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

➤ Number of grants awarded to faculties, programs, and institutions. (Number, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>8.00</td>
<td>20.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comments</td>
<td>This is the first round of grants to faculties and programs. A second round will be called shortly to disburse the remaining funds.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Establishment of an Office within the MoES to coordinate bilateral and multilateral agreement programs available to Montenegrin students and academic staff. (Text, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not established</td>
<td>In progress. Three individuals have been nominated to found the office</td>
<td>In progress, though not as a stand-alone office. These tasks as likely to be embedded in permanent staff posts, as opposed to a stand-alone office.</td>
<td>Office Established</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Number of students receiving scholarships for master's, doctoral and postdoctoral studies abroad. (Number, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>73.00</td>
<td>60.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Number of research and development subprojects implemented. (Number, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>7.00</td>
<td>12.00</td>
<td>12.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Increase in the number of Montenegrin researchers who participate in international R&D projects. (Number, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>200.00</td>
<td>235.00</td>
<td>235.00</td>
<td>235.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Development of framework for future CoE. (Text, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Framework for future CoE not developed</td>
<td>On target</td>
<td>On target</td>
<td>Framework for future CoE developed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Overall Comments

Data on Financial Performance

Disbursements (by loan)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project</th>
<th>Loan/Credit/TF</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Currency</th>
<th>Original</th>
<th>Revised</th>
<th>Cancelled</th>
<th>Disbursed</th>
<th>Undisbursed</th>
<th>Disbursed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>P122785</td>
<td>IBRD-81180</td>
<td>Effective</td>
<td>USD</td>
<td>15.98</td>
<td>15.98</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>7.37</td>
<td>8.16</td>
<td>46%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Key Dates (by loan)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project</th>
<th>Loan/Credit/TF</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Approval Date</th>
<th>Signing Date</th>
<th>Effectiveness Date</th>
<th>Orig. Closing Date</th>
<th>Rev. Closing Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Cumulative Disbursements
Restructuring History

There has been no restructuring to date.

Related Project(s)

There are no related projects.