

## Including Gender in the World Bank Transport Strategy

Peter Roberts, World Bank, Lead Infrastructure Advisor, Transport and Urban Department, 1818 H St. NW Washington DC 20433 tel: +1-202-473-3482  
proberts@worldbank.org

Mika Kunieda, World Bank, Consultant, Transport and Urban Department, physical address: c/o World Bank Ethiopia Country Office PO Box 5515 Addis Ababa, Ethiopia mkunieda@worldbank.org, tel: +251-91-1416141

### Introduction

This paper describes the need to update the World Bank's transport sector strategy to respond to important changes of approach in international Development. The paper recognizes the valuable contribution made by the independent Gender and Transport Network (GATNET) in providing consolidated comments on draft Transport Sector strategy (2007-2015). It outlines the process and summarises the comments which were made.

The new strategy has not yet been drafted in response to the wide range of comments received. The paper examines the scope in the new Transport Strategy for addressing the points raised by GATNET and for reflecting them in the final document of the strategy. It considers how the points might be integrated with other key issues, taking into account the context of World Bank operations.

The continuing role for an international community of practice is considered with the potential for GATNET to continue to make a key contribution in relation to the World Bank's Transport and Social Responsibility Thematic Group alongside specialist groups

### World Bank Transport Strategy - the case for updating

The Transport Sector Board (TSB) leads the World Bank's work in transport in response to demand by its countries 'partner countries'. The latest policy report to address transport as a whole was '*Sustainable Transport: Priorities for Policy Reform*' (World Bank, 1996) and this remains the key reference for the Bank's position on transport. It emphasizes the importance of economic, financial, environmental and social sustainability in transport - a concept which is still central and critical.

Thinking on wider development issues has progressed since 1996. For example the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs)<sup>1</sup> were agreed by the international community in 2000. From time to time TSB's evolving views on specific transport topics have been set out in a number of specialist documents, such as the transport guidance for Poverty Reduction Strategies (Gannon, C. et al, 2002) and the urban transport strategy (World Bank, 2002). The following were identified as the main emerging issues and trends which influence the Bank's approach to transport and development:

- Achieving the Millennium Development Goals will require renewed emphasis on economic growth as well as on social measures delivering benefits to the poor. Therefore, the Bank has adopted an Infrastructure Action Plan (World Bank 2004) to revitalize infrastructure support to economic growth. Transport is central to the Plan, since it constitutes about half of the Bank's infrastructure business.
- Good public governance is recognized as key to successful development through: competent state institutions to make and implement policy; the complementary roles of public and private sectors; the roles of markets and of regulations; and the importance of fighting corruption. Governance is especially

<sup>1</sup> <http://ddp-ext.worldbank.org/ext/GMIS/gdmis.do?siteId=2&menuId=LNAV01HOME1>

important to the transport industry because of its size and complexity, the strong public interest in its performance, and the heavy involvement of both public and private sectors in its operations.

- Country 'ownership' of development policies and processes is increasingly accepted by the international development community. For the transport sector this implies Bank support for partner countries in establishing institutions and capacity for public policy choice and implementation while sharing international experience of the practical alternatives.
- Lending programs for many middle income countries have declined since 1996, partly because the Bank's operations have not kept pace with their needs and growing economies. While this decline has been less pronounced in the transport sector than in the Bank as a whole, there is no room for complacency.
- Transport, at 15 percent of the Bank's lending commitments, is one of the largest components of development finance. The TSB needs to better measure the impact of sector interventions and to build this experience into future projects. So it is important for partner countries to keep better transport statistics and performance indicators for making decisions and monitoring outcomes.

In May 2005, the World Bank's Transport Sector Board decided to consider some realignment of work in the transport sector to reflect such recent trends. As a result, the Bank is planning to publish a document that will update the Transport Strategy to cover the period 2007-2015. The purpose of the update will be to articulate how the Bank's approach to transport and development is evolving; to identify planned adjustments to priorities and approach; and to explain these to our development partners and other stakeholders in the Bank's work.

### Consultation process

In March 2006 a draft of the revised strategy was made available on the internet for public consultation. This was to take account of external consultations together with inputs from other groups within the Bank and, in due course, to establish benchmarks and targets for agreed sector priorities. Contributions were invited from those with an interest in transport and development either in the form of specific comments on the draft, or as views on the Bank's role in the transport sector. The specific involvement of GATNET (Gender and Transport Network) was initiated by Peter Roberts, leader of the World Bank Transport and Social Responsibility thematic group.

GATNET is an international, multi-disciplinary community of practice, comprising professionals with an interest in gender and transport issues ([gatnet@dgroups.org](mailto:gatnet@dgroups.org)). It is open to all those who are interested in issues relating to improving mobility and access for poor women and men in developing countries. Primary communication for the network is through an email discussion and electronic bulletin board. Initial reaction to the invitation revealed a consensus amongst active GATNET members in favour of making a coordinated response. To maintain independence, the exercise was organized, moderated and documented by a handful of GATNET volunteers as a virtual discussion.

A month was available for the GATNET discussion. Members agreed to use this for two periods (each two weeks long) of semi-structured discussion. The aim of the first period was to identify a manageable number of key issues. The second period was for detailed discussion of those issues. A consolidated statement of the conclusions was then prepared, together with illustrations of how the points might be reflected in redrafting of the strategy.

The discussion which took place over four weeks generated 160 contributions from 29 participants. The guiding questions for this discussion are found in Annex 1 with the detailed discussion available in the archives of the GATNET site<sup>2</sup>.

The initial reaction of the GATNET members was that the draft Transport Strategy for 2007-2015 was gender neutral and thus required their input. Most people found the draft document accessible, well laid-out and easy to read. From a gender view-point, however, there were a

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.dgroups.org/groups/worldbank/gatnet/>

few key concerns which were identified. These were summarized on the basis of the first period of discussion. An extract from the summary of that discussion is in Annex 2.

### **GATNET proposals**

On the basis of the initial period, a further two weeks of contributions and intensive discussions followed. The main conclusions overall included the following:

- Recognize that gender concerns are not only about service delivery but also to support empowerment
- Follow-up studies on transport and gender and the gendered role of transport including access to services, empowerment, social capital, time poverty and personal security, amongst others.
- Collect gender disaggregated statistics
- Conduct a continuous gender analysis and/or review throughout the design, appraisal, implementation and evaluation stages
- Increase social/gender awareness and capacity amongst transportation professionals in the design of women friendly transport infrastructure, services and facilities.
- Include 'gender budgeting' in the policy dialogue.
- Increase participation by women in the transport sector.

Two presentational issues also emerged – first, over the title of the new strategy paper and, second, over images used on the cover and, possibly throughout the report.

### **Analysis of GATNET Proposals**

Overall GATNET's proposals were well-discussed, structured and constructive. A key concern which emerged strongly from the discussions was the issue of **equity** in terms of 'inclusion'. Was the strategy and the direction of the Bank's thinking towards equitable transport, (i.e. transport for men, women, the elderly, the young, the able and the disabled) apparent? The view of some in the community of practice was that equality should be the ultimate goal of the Bank's transport strategy and action plans, others suggested equity was a more realistic and sensible goal to set.

The overall conclusions of the full discussion which were summarized and sent to the World Bank are in Annex 3. It is a challenge for the Transport Strategy review team to do justice to these comments alongside a very large volume of other responses which have been received from organizations and individuals with broad or specialist interests in transport for development. A revised text of the proposed strategy is due to be presented to the TSB before the end of 2006.

The following sections of this paper reflect the views of the authors on the scope for the World Bank transport sector to respond in line with the theme of equity and the other comments from GATNET.

### **Scope for Transport Sector Action**

In countries where 'transport' is identified as a priority for the Country Assistance Strategy, Bank Transport staff work with counterparts in central and local government (transport ministries, road authorities and road agencies etc) to plan and supervise implementation / disbursement of transport related loans. Much of work is predated, is parallel or reinforced with analytical work done by the Bank itself or contracted out. Therefore, it is important to understand that although Bank staff can contribute to a strategy, program or project, it does not make the decisions for the countries it lends to. It is usually not practical for Bank staff to

initiate substantial innovations in sector policy without clear national commitments which are supportive to, for example the Beijing gender equity principles.

Ultimately it is necessary that there should be local commitment as a basis for deciding how gender issues will be integrated into the transport policy environment. In each country team Bank staff need to be able to facilitate and respond to such an environment. Thus Bank staff can influence program and project design. Much of the progress which has been achieved is due to not only the vision and hard effort of staff in partner countries but also to the initiative and commitment of Bank operations staff. The role of the Transport Anchor is to support and back up these operations by facilitating knowledge of good practice based on its analytical work.

In order to illustrate the importance of such analytical work we will look below, at common sense or common knowledge within the transport and gender community.

**Collect Gender Disaggregated Statistics:** Even when the value of disaggregated data is recognized, there are several disincentives to adopting the necessary measures, including the following:

- Disaggregation requires an increase in the sample size in order to maintain the desired level of significance for the target populations.
- Most transport studies focus on existing transport activity to determine what improvements may be justified – this is convenient and relatively low cost but tends to reinforce any existing bias towards any sections of the population (such as economically active males) whose needs are particularly well met by the existing transport system.
- Sections of the population whose needs are not well served by the transport system may be difficult to identify and to sample in a reliable manner.
- In any event, people whose needs are not well met by existing transport services may have difficulty in envisioning how their livelihoods may be realistically improved by transport interventions.

The TSR has identified established household data from nationally representative surveys as a potentially valuable source. There are various forms of such surveys, including the Living Standards Measurement Surveys (LSMS)<sup>3</sup>. These multi-topic surveys have been introduced with strong support from WB and other Agencies for the specific purpose of monitoring progress with development and poverty reduction in the poorest countries. As such they tend to focus on achieving the MDGs and often do not address transport issues in any detail. However, these surveys invariably cover some aspects of physical access (eg. to health and education services) and this is expanded to more detailed enquiries (such as access to an all-season road, or to a public transport survey) where this is required to meet national priorities.

The important feature of these surveys is that they assemble key data on lifestyle at the level of individuals. The data is usually made available in due course and the marginal cost on analyzing it for any particular purpose is very modest. Although there is great resistance to increasing the size of these already large surveys, there is some scope for modifying existing questions where this is recognized as improving the quality of the survey and it does not give rise to unacceptable discontinuity from previous surveys.

**Continue Gender Analysis Throughout the Project Cycle:** The importance of monitoring the implementation and impact of interventions, particularly in terms of social outcomes is acknowledged. This is particularly so with the inclusion of commonly underserved sections of the population for which special attention it likely to be required from the identification of needs and design of intervention, through implementing these interventions, determining the impacts on the target population and evaluating the longer term outcomes. Overall

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.worldbank.org/lsm/>

disaggregated data collection is important for this but it needs to be complemented by more detailed, local measures.

A network of project observatories is proposed on a pilot basis in a number of locations in Sub-Saharan African countries. These will record social parameters on a regular basis at fixed 'observation' locations related to road construction or other transport interventions.

**Raise Social/Gender Awareness Amongst Transport Professionals:** Officially the context for most countries is set by national commitments to international platforms, such as the 1979 Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Discrimination Against Women. However, the actual level and quality of social awareness will depend largely on the norms which prevail locally. These norms will be the product of sub-national culture within the national frame modified by changes in awareness as a result of international influences and evolving perceptions of the population in general and of the representatives and decision takers in particular.

World Bank teams working in Transport and other sectors which need to strengthen services for the sections of the population which may commonly be disempowered or, in other ways, are not effectively included increasingly comprise some staff with social development skills. They and the sector specialists are supported by guidance in a Social Analysis sourcebook (World Bank, 2002). This is complemented by specific guidance for addressing Gender issues (World Bank, 2005) which includes several cases from the transport sector. Recently further guidance has been published for social analysis in the Transport Sector (World Bank, 2006).

A Gender and Transport Resource Guide has been under preparation for the World Bank for more than a year as a compendium of good practice and other material. This draws on the experience of the Gender and Rural Transport Initiative which was supported by the World Bank and of a variety of other interventions. This draws attention to a number of concerns which are particular priorities for women, including the following:

- local access in the vicinity of the household with emphasis on walking, the use of non-motorised transport, shared taxis and similar modes as appropriate;
- freedom from the threat of violence and harassment in the street and on public transport;
- access to suitable public toilet facilities;
- removal of barriers which may constrain the mobility and access of adults (who are usually women) carrying infants and/or loads to or from market, both on foot and on public transport.

A draft of this Resource Guide is now due to be available for public comment by the end of August 2006.

**Participation by Women in the Transport Sector:** There is generally a very significant gender imbalance amongst employees in transport. To some extent this is seen as a consequence of the nature of the industry which involves a good deal of physically demanding work, often with lengthy periods away from home both in the construction of transport infrastructure and in operating transport services. The International Transport Workers' Federation has indicated that, in most countries, less than 10% of transport sector employees are likely to be women with the proportion likely to be even lower in many countries.

It is commonly said that there is a **lack of women in labour based road construction and maintenance, road infrastructure related employment** and there is **an imbalance of economic opportunities within the transport sector for women**. However there are examples where an equal number of men and women are participating in a road or building construction project and where the Addis Ababa parking fee collection is almost entirely done by females. This requires further examination to see whether there is an imbalance of

economic opportunities for women. At the same time, although it is a well proven fact that transport can help address such issues as gendered-time poverty, and economic empowerment through labour based methods, and small scale contracting, the fact that transport can not on its own solve the problem of gendered time poverty has not been adequately addressed. More emphasis is needed to address this problem through not only the transport sector but also other infrastructural areas, such as housing

The call for more gender disaggregated data has mounted in the past few years but there is still a lack of analysis utilizing this data or the non-recognition of the importance of disability disaggregated data and information or age disaggregated data on topics such as the needs of elderly women and young women as well as young mothers. This is why the Transport and Social Responsibility Thematic Group advocates the use of disaggregated data with gender as a main component within the context of inclusion. The suggested main sources of such disaggregated data would be household surveys, such as the Living Standards Measurement Survey by the Bank, the Demographic Health Surveys by the health sector, the Multiple Indicator Cluster Surveys by UNICEF and the Core Welfare Indicators Questionnaire.

**Gender Budgeting** is frequently proposed as a policy tool for transport governance and reform. However, international financial institutions have strong reservations against approaches since they foster the inefficient allocation of resources by focusing on the 'earmarking' of inputs rather than the achievement of required outcomes. Mandates or quotas tend to perpetuate inefficiency and inequity. . Instead our focus is to ensure that women's needs are included in transport sector policy making, policy implementation and other transport sector related activities through surveys and participatory processes. So the decisions on allocating resources to meet policy objectives such as promoting gender equity must be taken on these grounds within the national strategies.

### **Integration of Proposals with other Key Issues**

The Transport and Social Responsibility thematic group seeks to identify the intersection and overlap of interests between the different segments of the population and other social issues with which it engages. This opens opportunities for optimising synergies and for mitigating conflicts of interest.

**Making Transport Inclusive.** Current shortage of disaggregated data limits the analysis in this respect but some broad conclusions can be drawn with relevance to many countries. Women comprise the largest population segment (greater than 50%) which is commonly identified as being not well included in transport project design. They overlap with other large segments which are identified by the TSR, namely the poor, the elderly and those with disability (4-6% of whom about half are women).

With better information on diverse needs there will be opportunities to improve the allocation of resources and meet needs which would otherwise be neglected. Women should benefit disproportionately as a result. However, resource limitations will mean that any policy decision to invest in meeting the needs of particular groups (such as the disabled, for example) will diminish the benefits for those which are not part of that group.

Increased use of household surveys and similar sources of disaggregated data can be of benefit to all large sections of the population which are commonly neglected. A subjective assessment of priorities for improving universal access in many developing countries has indicated that improvements and the removal of barriers in the urban pedestrian environment will tend to bring the most significant improvements for many of the elderly and those with disability. They are also likely to give some net benefit to the population as a whole - and women in particular, since they generally make the greater number of walking trips.

**Local access and transport.** Access and mobility has long been recognized as particularly important for women in many rural locations since they bear the main responsibility for activities in the vicinity of the household and the village. The challenge of poor rural access is being high lighted by the Rural Access Index which has been adopted as part of the Results

Measurement Framework for IDA-14 (Roberts, 2006). The RAI highlights very significant regional differences in rural access. This is worst in Sub-Saharan Africa where the average is 30% as compared with nearly 60% in South Asia and around 90% in Eastern Europe and Central Asia.

Recently the importance of local access in the neighbourhood of urban households is also being recognized, again of particular importance for women in addressing their domestic responsibilities. This places emphasis on the suitability of the pedestrian environment and on the availability of formal and informal transport services. An Urban Mobility Index is being derived to draw attention to this aspect of the urban condition.

**Facilities which are Complementary to Transport:** Cultural constraints on the mobility of women need to be considered. In some countries or regions appropriate public toilet facilities, women only rooms/rest places or women-only train/bus compartments may be required to reduce cultural inhibitions to travel. In practice there is the need to raise awareness of good practice for inclusive design, not only for women. The promotion of inclusiveness should be an overarching continuous process.

### What Will Happen Next

The Transport Anchor, which is responsible for the Transport and Social Responsibility Thematic Group, has very limited resources. Therefore one of the underlying strategies of the Anchor is to partner internally and externally. Past collaboration with social analysis staff has resulted in fairly extensive coverage and analysis of how social analysis benefits the transport sector in the Social Analysis Sourcebook as well as a section on reducing gender inequality in the Transport chapter of the Poverty Reduction Strategy sourcebook and a key figure describing the application of a gender monitoring and evaluation framework on a village transport project within the Gender chapter of the sourcebook (p 585). More recently, the issue of strengthening cross-sectoral working or a multi-disciplinary process, in regards to time use has been raised in the context of preparation of a Bank Infrastructure Gender Action Plan.

Partnership with GATNET and the IFRTD, the Women's Committee within the US Transportation Research Board is another way forward as this has demonstrated to be successful in the past. Once again, partnership is the underlying principle of how the Bank works with the transport and gender community.

Since all Bank loans, grants and projects are aligned with client countries' Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers which is constructed by the participation of the people of the country with which the Bank works with through the Bank's Country Assistance Strategy, which are in turn aligned with the MDGs, it would be more productive for gender mainstreaming to examine the PRSP or the policy environment of Bank client countries rather than an individual loan, grant or project approved by the Bank's board. At the same time, it would be extremely effective for a multidisciplinary external group to conduct a continuous gender review of any sector development activity to ensure consistency between policy and practice or the design of a project. The client country, could also at the design stage spontaneously conduct a social/gender assessment rather than the Bank imposing a social analysis. There have been reports that have demonstrated a rise in gender analysis in particularly health and education projects at this stage which will hopefully rise with the current multidisciplinary process of project appraisal processes in place.

### Conclusion

For the past decade there have been efforts by the World Bank to strengthen the gender balance of its assistance. This has been supported by the preparation of multi-sectoral guidance and the formation of the Transport and Social Responsibility thematic group which facilitates access to good practice on gender and other issues in the planning, design and implementation of transport assistance. However, there is concern in the Transport Sector over the disappointing results of attempting to scale-up and mainstream gender interventions. This concern is now shared widely within the World Bank, prompting the preparation of a multi-sectoral Gender Action Plan to which the Transport Group and TSR will contribute. The

World Bank Transport Strategy 2007-2015 will endorse this position and will foster approaches which improve the gender outcomes of future support in the sector.

GATNET, an independent network of specialists on gender issues in transport set up a process to discuss the draft Strategy and to achieve consensus on comments about its gender perspective amongst a large number of participants. These consolidated comments provide the strategy review team with valuable guidance for sharpening this aspect of the Strategy. The paper summarises the main points which were identified by GATNET and examines options for addressing these points in the final document and in practice. It sets this in the context of the constraints within which the World Bank has to work and examines the extent to which gender issues need to be integrated with other concerns for inclusion and social considerations

The TSR thematic group will continue to contribute to a wide community of practice which promotes good practice in multi-disciplinary approaches for social and gender analysis within the World Bank transport sector and amongst other professional groups. In particular it encourages sector teams in the Bank's Regions and with other development agencies the collection and use of gender disaggregated data for planning, implementing and evaluation of transport interventions and for analytical sector work in the various regions. The TSR thematic group values the participation of GATNET members to continue to contribute in policy discussions, sharing good practice, monitoring and evaluation. Alongside other specialist groups they can actively contribute to delivering the paradigm of inclusive transport – 'transport for all'.

## References

- Bamberger, M., Blackden, M., Fort, L. and Manoukian, V. (2002) Chapter 10: Gender in A Sourcebook for Poverty Reduction Strategies Volume I pp. 335-374
- Gannon, C., Gwilliam, K., Liu, Z., and Malmberg Calvo, C. (2002) Chapter 22: Transport in A Sourcebook for Poverty Reduction Strategies Volume II pp. 327-374, World Bank
- GATNET (2006) Summary of week 1 and 2 discussions accessible at [www.gatnet.net](http://www.gatnet.net)
- GATNET (2006) GATNET SPEAKS: Review of World Bank Draft Transport Strategy 2007 – 2015 accessible at [www.gatnet.net](http://www.gatnet.net)
- Riverson, J. D., Kunieda, M., Roberts, P., Negede, L. and Walker, W. (2006) 'Challenges of addressing Gender Dimensions of Transport in Developing Countries' Transportation Research Board Washington DC: January, 2006.
- Roberts, P. and Babinard J. (2004) 'Transport Strategy to improve Accessibility in Developing Countries' 10<sup>th</sup> International TRANSED, Hamamatsu: May, 2004
- Vagland, A. (2004) 'Gender Equality as a Subsidiary Objective of Swedish Transport Policy' Chicago: November, 2004
- World Bank (1996) 'Sustainable Transport: Priorities for Policy Reform'
- World Bank (2002) 'Cities on the Move – a World Bank urban transport strategy review'
- World Bank Social Development Department (2003) Social Analysis Sourcebook: Incorporating Social Dimensions into Bank-supported Projects
- World Bank Social Development Department (2005) Gender-Responsive Social Analysis: A Guidance Note - Incorporating Social Dimensions into Bank-supported Projects
- World Bank Social Development Department (2006) Transport and Social Analysis: A Guidance Note - Incorporating Social Dimensions into Bank-supported Projects

## Annexes

- Annex 1: Issues and guiding questions of GATNET consultation on the World Bank Transport Strategy**
- Annex 2: GATNET Consultations: Summary of week 1 and 2 discussions**
- Annex 3: GATNET SPEAKS: Review of World Bank Draft Transport Strategy 2007–2015**

**Annex 1: Issues and guiding questions of GATNET consultation on the World Bank Transport Strategy**

**Issue:** Based on the overall organization of the document:

**Question i.**

Does the structure provide a sufficient framework through which key gender concerns in transport sector can be properly articulated?

**Question ii.**

Are there particular sections of the document that have made an attempt to present gender orientated thinking? Is this sufficiently done? What more would you like to see included?

**Issue:** Section 1, Origins of the Report, provides 5 bullet points on key issues and trends that are informing the new strategic directions that the Bank would like to via this document.

**Question iii:**

Are you satisfied that these 5 bullet points provide a sufficient framework to guide a gender informed policy? Is there a way in which you would like to see gender issues anchored right from the beginning of the document

**Issue: Transport and MDGs:** Section 2, sub-section 2.1, presents 5 bullet points on how transport contributes to MDGs.

**Question iv:** Are you satisfied that the links between transport and the MDGs as presented are sufficiently gender informed?

**Issue:** Strategy Update: Section Five of the document is important as it spells out the new strategic priorities and directions for the Bank. Five priorities are spelt in sub-section 5.1.

**Question v:** Are you happy with these priorities? Do they provide an outline of a more gender empowering transport sector for the next decade?

**Issue: Changes needed in order to meet priorities:** Sub-section 5.2 indicates the changes that the Bank will undertake in order to meet the priorities presented in 5.1.

**Question vi:** Looking at the five bullet points of proposed changes, are you satisfied that they are aligned with the gender response you would like to see?

**Annex 2: GATNET Consultations: Summary of week 1 and 2 discussions**

*A starting point for the discussion was the question whether, overall, the document offers a sufficient framework from which gender-informed strategies can be advanced. While some responses suggested that the shortcomings in the draft could be dealt with by sharpening the gender dimensions in various sections, many of the contributions also implied that the document fails to engage a gendered view of the issues and priorities right from the start. The introductory and foundational sections of the document [Pages 1-2], fail to present gender as a key anchor to the analysis and setting of priorities in the strategy. Subsequently, and despite a few references to gender in pages 10-16, overall gender thinking is patchy and fragmented.*

*It was suggested that to begin with, an unequivocal gender tone and direction should have been set, if not by the title, at least in the explanation given to the title. While the strategy makes notable advances in incorporating a social agenda in the transport sector, it fails to provide strategic leadership in profiling the role of gender in achievement of desired transport sector goals. One contributor observed the gender neutral direction taken by the title saying “[...To ensure the strategy is truly anchored in gender thinking]....I would start from the very beginning. More could have been done with the title to reflect social issues. The choice of words in the title Safe Clean and Affordable... Transport for Development ....gives a clue to the... [gender-neutral] thinking...”.*

*There are a few sections that present a gendered perspective on some of the issues. The discussion of MDG goals, [Pgs 10 and 16], Section 2.5 on the impact of roads on health status of women, gender disaggregated data in box 2.2, the importance of IMT in box 2.3, box 2-4 on specific transport needs, and pages 14 and 15 (in relation to improved access to social services). Most responses saw the isolated mention of gender/women/girls as insufficient.*

*Further it was observed that while the strategy draws many of its other arguments and positions on the basis of studies done, especially by the Bank, no reference is made of the World Bank commissioned studies of Integrating Gender in Transport Sector Programs. The recommendations made by gender cases studies and other studies on transport and gender are still valid, but remain unimplemented*

*There is a reservation about the general ability of the Bank itself to satisfactorily implement gender informed programmes not only in the transport sector, but in other sectors. By way of example, an argument was made that transport itself cannot play a “gender-significant” role in trade, in the context of existing international trading patterns that are themselves not well gendered. It may therefore not be enough to argue for a gender informed transport strategy, but also to continue with other parallel efforts to make the Bank more gender accountable in policy and practice via continuous independent reviews and critiques of its positions.*

**(Source: Summary of week 1 and 2 discussions, compiled by Peter Njenga)**

### Annex 3: GATNET SPEAKS: Review of World Bank Draft Transport Strategy 2007 – 2015

#### Introduction

This note is a result of a structured virtual discussion among members of GATNET (Gender and Transport Network) on the World Bank's draft strategy for the transport sector (2007-2015). GATNET is an international, multi-disciplinary community of practice, comprising professionals with an interest in gender and transport issues ([gatnet@dgroups.org](mailto:gatnet@dgroups.org))

The discussion took place over four weeks and generated 157 messages from 30 participants. The detailed discussion is available in the archives of the GATNET site. <http://www.dgroups.org/groups/worldbank/gatnet/> This note is a summary of the key issues, and the recommendations that derive from them.

#### General Comments

The strategy identifies key transport concerns, using empirical data to justify why they are important and why action should be taken, offering a sufficient framework through which key gender concerns in the sector could be adequately articulated. However, the strategy is not informed by a gender analysis and makes little or no use of what is known about the social organisation of transport, in general, and gender and transport, in particular. There is a superficial treatment of gender throughout the document. The words gender, women and girls are mentioned a few times in isolated pages and even then the discussion is not substantive. The failure to use gender as a category of analysis is reflected in the prioritised areas.

GATNET would like to propose that the strategy sets an unequivocal gender tone from the beginning. As one contributor to the discussion observed.

“The choice of words in the title *Safe Clean and Affordable... Transport for Development* ...gives a clue to the... [gender-neutral] thinking...”.

**GATNET proposes that the word ‘equitable’ is included in the title** and suggests that the title be amended to: *“Safe, Clean and Equitable.. Transport for Development”*

Further it was observed that while the strategy draws many of its other arguments and positions on the basis of studies done, especially by the Bank, no reference is made of the World Bank Commissioned studies of integrating gender in transport sector programmes.

**GATNET proposes that the transport sector board revisits these studies**, since the recommendations made by gender case studies and other studies on transport and gender are still valid, but remain unimplemented.

#### Gender and Transport Studies

- Bangladesh Rural: Third Rural Infrastructure Development Project (RDP 21)
- Bangladesh Urban: Dhaka Urban Transport Project
- China: CIDA's Comprehensive Transport Management Training Project
- Lao: Project Planning and Design
- Lesotho: Integrating Gender into the Ireland Aid Financed Rural Roads and Access Program
- Peru: Transport Rehabilitation Project
- Senegal: The National Rural Infrastructure Project(NRIP)
- South Africa: SHOVA KALULA Program
- Uganda: Road Sector Programme Support (RSPS)
- Vietnam: Rural Infrastructure Inland Waterway Project
- India: Tamil Nadu bicycle project (IFRTD)
- Intermediate Means of Transport: Bicycles and rural women in Uganda
- Peru: Lima bicycle project
- The Role of Women in Rural Transport: Access of women to domestic facilities
- Balancing the Load. Women, Gender and Transport . Co edited by Priyanthi Fernando and Gina Porter (2002) Zed Books, London
- World Bank Gender and Rural Transport Initiative (GRTI) – *CD Rom with full outputs from this programme to be published shortly.*

## Priority Gender and Transport Issues

There are many section-by-section issues that the GATNET team has tracked into the draft document itself. This amended version of the draft strategy is attached for your reference. Overall, members of GATNET felt that the following gender issues should be explicitly discussed and prioritized in the Strategy.

- The gendered role of transport in MDGs is not just about access to services, it is also about empowerment, social capital, time poverty and personal security, amongst others. The discussion on the MDGs should focus on:
  - high maternal mortality rates in Africa and the role of transport, recognizing that issues such as improved maternal mortality cannot be addressed as a side effect of general transport interventions but rather require a gendered approach to the delivery of services
  - the role of transport in trade - not just international trade but also the significant gender and transport issues faced by women working in town-to-town trade, cross-border merchandising or in export oriented industries and horticultural farms
  - the underlying gender distinction in the patterns and purposes of urban trip making and its relevance to the development of IMTs, infrastructure and services, public transport facilities, routes, fares and service schedules
  - the gendered nature of economic opportunities and the way in which transport will help address such issues as gendered-time poverty, and economic empowerment through labour based methods, and small scale contracting
- Transport in most of the poor regions of the world is undertaken away from highways and involves a huge amount of walking and carrying, especially for women who have a relatively high transport burden.
- The lack of gender analysis capacity in the transport sector, which is the result of under-representation of women in the transport sector; and of inadequate gender capacity among transport professionals.
- The lack of gender disaggregated data to inform transport policy and practice.
- Inadequate women-friendly supportive infrastructure, such as road-side toilets, in Africa and Asia where prevailing gender relations restrict women's mobility in the absence of such facilities
- The importance of designing gender sensitive transport technologies such as easy boarding and lighting on BRT for women with loads or carrying children, and also for the elderly and for people with disabilities
- Caution about designing-out capacity for carrying loads on 'passenger transport', based on over simplified concepts of road safety, which can be detrimental to gender equity, especially in countries where women's economic welfare can be very tightly linked to small trading and petty trading

## Specific Recommendations

GATNET recommends that the realignment of the World Bank's development support should

- provide increased lending not just to urban projects and trade-based freight transport infrastructure, but also to **providing priority access to those households and communities outside the 2km range of access.**
- ensure that investments in roads and highways incorporate **supporting infrastructure** such as separate roadside toilet facilities and women only rooms/rest places, women only train/bus compartments.
- **incorporate the underlying gender distinction in the patterns and purposes of urban trip making** into its increased engagement in urban transport especially with relevance to the development of IMTs, infrastructure and services, public transport facilities, routes, fares and service schedules

- expand its increased engagement in transport for trade to consider the significant **gender and transport issues for women working in town-to-town trade, cross-border merchandising or in export oriented industries and horticultural farms**
- stimulate the market for **women friendly transport services**, especially services based on non-motorised and intermediate means of transport
- widen the application of social and environmental issues by **incorporating gender analysis and impact assessment** into all transport interventions, identification, design, appraisal, implementation, monitoring and evaluation and by **paying explicit attention to tackling issues relating to the impact of transport on women's health and maternal mortality, and the gender impacts of road safety.**

If the World Bank is to engender the realignment of its development support to the transport sector as outlined above, GATNET feels that it needs to mainstream gender into its way of doing business. This would require realigning the Bank's approach to

- Include **gender budgeting** into the policy dialogue on transport governance and reform and promote **greater involvement of women in the transport sector** of client countries.
- Increase partnerships with social development units within the Bank, and in client countries, and also **engage more proactively with global communities such as GATNET and the International Forum for Rural Transport and Development (IFRTD).**
- Use **gender disaggregated data** to assess the performance of the transport sector in developing countries and **strengthen capacity to carry out gender analysis and planning** within the transport sector in client countries and within the transport units in the Bank. Develop a gender and transport checklist that can enable task managers to mainstream gender into all Bank lending to the transport sector.
- Ensure that all 'flagship reports' commissioned by the TSB mainstream gender and take greater cognizance of the Bank commissioned studies on gender and transport. Ensure allocation of resources to the commissioning of studies that will increase the Bank's understanding of gender and transport, at a global, regional and national level. Document best practice of mainstreaming gender.
- Carry out a **continuous gender review of the strategy** in order to ensure consistency between policy and practice. Establish an independent mechanism that allows for
  - (At the design phase) confirmation that any loan, grant or project (document) complies with the engendered strategy and MDGs;
  - (At appraisal) all World Bank projects conducting routine gender reviews of the design;
  - (During Implementation) Monitoring to ensure that the operations on the ground are compliant with the engendered strategy, MDGs and World Bank-recipient agreement.
  - Evaluation: To ensure that the evaluation and impact reports document impact on gender and MDGs and to certify that the evaluation team is engendered too

### **Institutional Support**

International Forum for Rural Transport and Development (IFRTD)

#### **Moderators**

Peter Njenga, IFRTD

Priyanthi Fernando, CePA

#### **Data Base**

Maha Khan, Consultant

Eric Britton, Consultant

#### **Consultation Coordinator**

Nite Tanzarn, Professor

2 May 2006